



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

LITERATURE IN THE ELEMENTARY CURRICULUM

J. F. BOBBITT, A. C. BOYCE, AND M. L. PERKINS
University of Chicago

In what school grade should any given piece of literature be read? Obviously, it ought to be used in that grade where, as shown by practical experience, it works best. Our questions can therefore be asked in terms of practical experience: Into what school grade has any given piece of literature tended to gravitate in the country-wide "trial-and-error" experimentation that is going on? By examining the courses of study used in the various cities and states, it is possible to locate the grade in which the given piece is most frequently used at the present time. This is the best evidence that we can now have as to where it belongs.

It must be remembered, however, that the experimentation is not ended. Certain pieces have got their present position through tradition and custom, and have not fully gravitated to the place where they belong. Others have found their place in the curriculum as the result of special systems of educational thought; these in many cases will be shifted as the systems of thought are modified or discarded. Notwithstanding these and other similar disturbing factors, it can still be safely said that the consensus of experience in the country, as shown by a full tabulation of courses of study, is the surest authority as to the rightful position in the elementary school of any particular literary selection.

The present study was undertaken for the purpose of ascertaining what readings were used in the elementary schools of the United States and in what grades. Our supply of printed courses was incomplete. Of those at hand, very many suggested only the general lines of work, and apparently left to principals and teachers a large amount of freedom in the selection. It was possible, however, to select fifty printed courses which presented reasonably full statements as to what was to be read and the grade in which it was to be used. Of these, thirty-six were of cities, among which were to be found New York City, Boston, Washington, D.C., Cin-

cinnati, Minneapolis, Detroit, Tacoma, and San Francisco. Fourteen were state courses representing states in all portions of the country, from Massachusetts and New York on the Atlantic seaboard to Washington on the Pacific side. It is believed that the consensus of these fifty courses will approximate the results which would be obtained were it possible to know what is being done in every city and state.

The inaccuracy with which printed courses of study represent the work actually done is sufficiently well known. Still, it is believed that the readings most often recommended in the printed courses are the ones most often to be found in actual practice; and those least often referred to in the courses are the ones that will least often be used in practice. Our aim, therefore, under the circumstances, is to show accurately the relative frequencies of recommendations as an approximate index of the relative frequencies of use. Our aim is relative emphasis, not absolute number. It is believed that the tabulations fairly present relative emphases.

The following lists include only the longer readings—books, long stories, and the longer poems. Short stories and poems have been tabulated separately and conclusions concerning these will be published in a later issue.

In the first of the following lists, the readings are alphabetical, by authors. In the original tabulation of the fifty courses, 138 authors, represented by 296 titles, were found. Obviously a book that occurred but once or twice in the fifty courses, however, represented special circumstances; and in tabulating consensus of practice, it could well be omitted from the list. The 113 titles that occurred only one, two, or three times have been eliminated. The list as given below includes the 183 titles that are recommended four or more times in the fifty courses.

The number of times a title was recommended in the fifty courses is stated in the first tabular column. The second column represents the grade for which the piece was most often recommended. In case a title was recommended equally often for two grades, the figure chosen was the one that lay nearest the majority-practice, as shown by the entire array of recommendations. The third column shows the range of grades for which the title is recommended in the fifty courses of study.

GENERAL LIST

Author	Title	Times Recom- mended	Grade	Range of Recom- mendations
Anonymous	<i>Arabian Nights</i>	22	6	1-8
Aanrud	<i>Lizbeth Longfrock</i>	5	4	3-7
Abbott	<i>Boy on the Farm</i>	5	4	3-5
Aesop	<i>Fables</i>	18	4	1-8
Alcott	<i>Eight Cousins</i>	6	5	4-8
	<i>Jack and Jill</i>	4	6	5-6
	<i>Little Men</i>	17	6	3-8
	<i>Little Women</i>	18	5	3-8
	<i>Old-Fashioned Girl</i>	7	7	5-8
	<i>Under the Lilacs</i>	9	6	3-6
Aldrich	<i>Story of a Bad Boy</i>	12	6	4-8
Amicis	<i>Cuore</i>	4	5	5-8
Andersen	<i>Fairy Tales</i>	28	4	1-6
	<i>Ugly Duckling</i>	4	1	1-5
Andrews, G.	<i>Each and All</i>	11	4	2-5
	<i>Seven Little Sisters</i>	23	3	1-4
	<i>Ten Boys</i>	15	5	3-6
Andrews, M. R. S.	<i>Perfect Tribute</i>	4	...	7-8
Arnold	<i>Sohrab and Rustum</i>	4	8	7-8
Baldwin	<i>Discovery of the Old Northwest</i>	6	7	5-8
	<i>Fairy Stories and Fables</i>	13	3	1-4
	<i>Fifty Famous Stories Retold</i>	30	4	3-7
	<i>Hero Stories Told in School</i>	5	5	5
	<i>Old Greek Stories</i>	24	4	1-7
	<i>Story of Roland</i>	9	7	5-7
	<i>Story of Siegfried</i>	13	7	4-7
	<i>Thirty More Famous Stories</i>	9	4	3-6
Beckwith	<i>In Mythland</i>	8	3	1-4
Bennett	<i>Master Skylark</i>	4	7	7-8
Brooks	<i>Stories of the Red Children</i>	6	2	1-4
Brown, A. F.	<i>In the Days of Giants</i>	12	5	1-6
Brown, G.	<i>Rab and His Friends</i>	15	4	2-8
Browning	<i>Pied Piper of Hamelin</i>	11	3	2-7
Bunyan	<i>Pilgrim's Progress</i>	9	7	4-8
Burnett	<i>Little Lord Fauntleroy</i>	14	5	3-7
Burroughs	<i>Birds and Bees</i>	18	7	6-8
	<i>Sharp Eyes</i>	11	7	6-8
	<i>Squirrels and Other Fur Bearers</i>	10	6	5-8
Carpenter	<i>Africa</i>	7	6	4-7
	<i>Asia</i>	9	5	4-7
	<i>Australia</i>	7	6	4-7
	<i>Europe</i>	9	6	4-7
	<i>How We Are Clothed</i>	5	6	4-8
	<i>How We Are Fed</i>	6	8	4-8
	<i>North America</i>	9	5	4-6
	<i>South America</i>	7	6	4-7
Carroll	<i>Alice in Wonderland</i>	27	4	3-7
	<i>Through the Looking Glass</i>	9	5	4-7
Carter	<i>Story of Brave Dogs</i>	5	4	3-5
Church	<i>Story of the "Iliad"</i>	8	5	4-8
	<i>Story of the "Odyssey"</i>	9	5	3-8

GENERAL LIST—Continued

Author	Title	Times Recom- mended	Grade	Range of Recom- mendations
Clarke	<i>Story of Ulysses</i>	9	5	3-6
	<i>Story of Troy</i>	4	5	4-6
Clemens	<i>The Prince and the Pauper</i>	10	7	5-8
	<i>Tom Sawyer</i>	6	7	6-8
Collodi	<i>Pinocchio</i>	9	4	1-7
Cooke	<i>Nature Myths and Stories</i>	5	2	1-3
Coolidge	<i>How the Leaves Come Down</i>	4	2	2-3
Cooper	<i>Deerslayer</i>	7	7	5-7
	<i>Last of the Mohicans</i>	17	7	6-8
	<i>The Spy</i>	13	7	6-8
Craik (Mulock)	<i>Adventures of a Brownie</i>	21	4	2-6
	<i>Little Lame Prince</i>	17	3	2-6
Craik	<i>Bow-wow and Mew-mew</i>	6	2	1-2
Dana	<i>Two Years Before the Mast</i>	11	7	6-8
Defoe	<i>Robinson Crusoe</i>	29	4	1-7
Dickens	<i>Christmas Carol</i>	25	7	3-8
	<i>Cricket on the Hearth</i>	14	8	6-8
	<i>David Copperfield</i>	11	7	5-8
Dodge	<i>Donald and Dorothy</i>	5	5	3-7
	<i>Hans Brinker</i>	19	6	4-8
Dopp	<i>Early Cave Men</i>	8	3	1-6
	<i>Tree Dwellers</i>	7	3	1-6
Du Chaillu	<i>The Land of the Long Night</i>	4	7	6-7
Dutton	<i>In Field and Pasture</i>	5	3	1-3
Eddy	<i>Friends and Helpers</i>	7	4	3-5
Eggleston	<i>First Book in American History</i>	8	5	4-6
	<i>Hoosier School Boy</i>	11	6	3-8
	<i>Hoosier School Master</i>	5	7	5-8
	<i>Stories of American Life and Adventure</i>	7	4	3-6
	<i>Stories of Great Americans for Little Americans</i>	13	3	3-4
Eliot	<i>Silas Marner</i>	8	8	8
Ewing	<i>Jackanapes</i>	11	5	3-6
Franklin	<i>Autobiography</i>	12	7	5-8
Frost	<i>Court of King Arthur</i>	5	6	5-7
Goldsmith	<i>Deserted Village</i>	7	8	7-8
Grimm	<i>Fairy Tales (for young children)</i>	16	1	1-4
	<i>Household Stories</i>	6	3	3-4
Grover	<i>Overall Boys</i>	7	1	1-2
	<i>Sunbonnet Babies</i>	8	1	1-2
Guerber	<i>Story of the English</i>	7	6	6-8
	<i>Story of the Greeks</i>	6	6	5-8
	<i>Story of the Romans</i>	8	6	5-9
Hale, L. P.	<i>Peterkin Papers</i>	5	5	2-5
Hale, E. E.	<i>The Man Without a Country</i>	31	8	6-8
Hall	<i>Four Old Greeks</i>	4	5	3-5
Harris	<i>Uncle Remus</i>	12	5	1-7
Hawthorne	<i>Grandfather's Chair</i>	11	7	6-8
	<i>Snow Image</i>	5	7	3-7
	<i>Tanglewood Tales</i>	22	5	1-7
	<i>The Great Stone Face</i>	12	7	4-8

GENERAL LIST—Continued

Author	Title	Times Recom- mended	Grade	Range of Recom- mendations
Hawthorne (<i>cont.</i>)	<i>Twice-Told Tales</i>	6	6	6-8
	<i>Wonder Book</i>	27	5	3-7
Holbrook	<i>Nature Myths</i>	11	2	1-5
Hopkins	<i>Sandman</i>	4	3	1-3
Hughes	<i>Tom Brown at Rugby</i>	6	7	6-8
	<i>Tom Brown's School Days</i>	13	8	4-8
Irving	<i>Alhambra</i>	5	8	7-8
	<i>Rip Van Winkle</i>	16	6	2-8
	<i>Sketch Book</i>	19	7	6-8
	<i>The Legend of Sleepy Hollow</i>	11	7	5-8
Johonnot	<i>Ten Great Events in History</i>	5	8	6-8
Kingsley	<i>Greek Heroes</i>	11	5	5-7
	<i>Water Babies</i>	17	4	3-6
	<i>Westward Ho!</i>	4	7	6-8
Kipling	<i>Captains Courageous</i>	11	7	6-8
	<i>Jungle Books 1 and 2</i>	20	5	2-7
	<i>Just-so Stories</i>	17	5	1-8
Lamb	<i>Adventures of Ulysses</i>	7	6	6-8
	<i>Tales from Shakespeare</i>	28	7	5-8
Lang	<i>Blue Fairy Book</i>	4	1	1-4
Lear	<i>Nonsense Songs and Stories</i>	4	3	1-6
Long	<i>Secrets of the Woods</i>	6	5	5-7
	<i>Wilderness Ways</i>	12	5	3-7
Longfellow	<i>Evangeline</i>	23	7	5-8
	<i>Hiawatha</i>	27	2	1-6
	<i>Miles Standish</i>	23	7	5-8
	<i>Tales of a Wayside Inn</i>	8	7	6-9
Lowell	<i>Vision of Sir Launfal</i>	13	8	7-8
Mabie	<i>Norse Stories Retold from the Eddas</i>	16	5	2-8
Macaulay	<i>Horatius at the Bridge</i>	11	7	4-8
McDonald	<i>At the Back of the North Wind</i>	5	5	3-7
McMurry	<i>Classic Stories</i>	6	2	1-3
Monroe	<i>Flamingo Feather</i>	5	5	5-8
Nicolay	<i>Boy's Life of Abraham Lincoln</i>	4	8	4-8
Otis (<i>pseud.</i>)	<i>Toby Tyler</i>	7	4	3-6
Page	<i>Two Little Confederates</i>	9	5	3-8
Parkman	<i>Oregon Trail</i>	5	8	5-8
Pratt	<i>Legends of Norseland</i>	4	5	5-7
	<i>Legends of the Red Children</i>	10	3	1-4
Pyle	<i>Men of Iron</i>	4	7	6-7
	<i>Merry Adventures of Robin Hood</i>	17	5	4-8
	<i>Story of King Arthur and His Knights</i>	11	5	4-8
Radford	<i>King Arthur and His Knights</i>	14	6	4-8
Ramée	<i>Moufflon</i>	6	4	1-5
Rice	<i>Mrs. Wiggs of the Cabbage Patch</i>	4	8	6-8
Ruskin	<i>King of the Golden River</i>	30	5	3-7
Schwatka	<i>Children of the Cold</i>	6	5	3-6
Scott	<i>Ivanhoe</i>	14	8	6-9
	<i>Kenilworth</i>	7	8	6-8
	<i>Lady of the Lake</i>	20	8	6-9
	<i>Lay of the Last Minstrel</i>	4	7-8

GENERAL LIST—*Concluded*

Author	Title	Times Recom- mended	Grade	Range of Recom- mendations
Scudder.....	<i>Book of Legends</i>	5	4	3-5
	<i>Fables, Folk Stories and Legends</i>	15	3	1-4
Seton.....	<i>Lives of the Hunted</i>	9	5	4-6
	<i>Lobo, Rag and Vixen</i>	9	5	4-6
	<i>Wild Animals I Have Known</i>	18	5	1-7
Sewell.....	<i>Black Beauty</i>	31	5	3-8
Shakespeare.....	<i>Julius Caesar</i>	18	8	6-9
	<i>Merchant of Venice</i>	14	8	8-9
Shaw, C.....	<i>Story of the Ancient Greeks</i>	4	6	6-8
Shaw, E. R.....	<i>Big and Little People of Other Lands</i>	11	3	2-4
Smith.....	<i>Eskimo Stories</i>	8	2	1-3
Snedden.....	<i>Docas, the Indian Boy</i>	9	4	3-6
Spyri.....	<i>Heidi</i>	15	6	3-6
	<i>Moni, the Goat Boy</i>	8	5	4-6
Stevenson.....	<i>Child's Garden of Verses</i>	14	3	1-7
	<i>Kidnapped</i>	6	8	7-8
	<i>Treasure Island</i>	17	8	3-8
Stockton.....	<i>Fanciful Tales</i>	19	5	1-6
Stoddard.....	<i>Little Smoke</i>	5	5	3-6
Stowe.....	<i>Uncle Tom's Cabin</i>	10	8	6-8
Swift.....	<i>Gulliver's Travels</i>	14	6	4-8
Tennyson.....	<i>Idylls of the King</i>	4	8	8
Thaxter.....	<i>Madame Arachne</i>	4	3	2-4
Turpin.....	<i>Classic Fables</i>	4	3	1-3
Van Bergen.....	<i>Story of China</i>	5	7	6-8
Van Dyke.....	<i>First Christmas Tree</i>	4	6	6-8
Waterloo.....	<i>Story of Ab</i>	6	1	1-8
Whittier.....	<i>Snow-Bound</i>	24	7	6-8
Wiggin.....	<i>Birds' Christmas Carol</i>	23	4	1-8
	<i>Rebecca of Sunnybrook Farm</i>	7	8	5-8
	<i>Story of Patsy</i>	7	8	2-8
Wiltse.....	<i>Folklore Stories and Proverbs</i>	5	2	1-3
Wyss.....	<i>Swiss Family Robinson</i>	23	5	3-7

No school can use all this list of 183 titles. Selection must be made. One must not blindly follow consensus of practice. But in this field, at least, it is the safest single guide. The second list shows the selections most frequently used in each grade, in the order of their frequency.

SELECTED LIST OF TITLES IN ELEMENTARY SCHOOL LITERATURE
INCLUDING THOSE APPEARING NINE TIMES OR MORE IN THE COURSES STUDIED

	Title	No. Times Recom- mended	Most Frequent Grade	Range of Grades
GRADE I—				
Grimm	<i>Fairy Tales</i> (for young children)	16	1	1-4
GRADE II—				
Longfellow	<i>Hiawatha</i>	27	2	1-6
Holbrook	<i>Nature Myths</i>	11	2	1-5
GRADE III—				
Andrews	<i>Seven Little Sisters</i>	23	3	1-4
Craik	<i>Little Lame Prince</i>	17	3	2-6
Scudder	<i>Fables, Folk Stories and Legends</i>	15	3	1-4
Stevenson	<i>Child's Garden of Verses</i>	14	3	1-7
Baldwin	<i>Fairy Stories and Fables</i>	13	3	1-4
Eggleston	<i>Stories of Great Americans for Little Americans</i>	13	3	3-4
Browning	<i>Pied Piper of Hamelin</i>	11	3	2-7
Shaw	<i>Big and Little People of Other Lands</i>	11	3	2-4
Pratt	<i>Legends of the Red Children</i>	10	3	1-4
GRADE IV—				
Baldwin	<i>Fifty Famous Stories Retold</i>	30	4	3-7
Defoe	<i>Robinson Crusoe</i>	29	4	1-7
Andersen	<i>Fairy Tales</i>	28	4	1-6
Carroll	<i>Alice in Wonderland</i>	27	4	3-7
Baldwin	<i>Old Greek Stories</i>	24	4	1-7
Wiggin	<i>Birds' Christmas Carol</i>	23	4	1-8
Craik	<i>Adventures of a Brownie</i>	21	4	2-6
Aesop	<i>Fables</i>	18	4	1-8
Kingsley	<i>Water Babies</i>	17	4	3-6
Brown	<i>Rab and His Friends</i>	15	4	2-8
Andrews	<i>Each and All</i>	11	4	2-5
Baldwin	<i>Thirty More Famous Stories</i>	9	4	3-6
Collodi	<i>Pinocchio</i>	9	4	1-7
Snedden	<i>Docas, the Indian Boy</i>	9	4	3-6
GRADE V—				
Sewell	<i>Black Beauty</i>	31	5	3-8
Ruskin	<i>King of the Golden River</i>	30	5	3-7
Hawthorne	<i>Wonder Book</i>	27	5	3-7
Wyss	<i>Swiss Family Robinson</i>	23	5	3-7
Hawthorne	<i>Tanglewood Tales</i>	22	5	1-7
Kipling	<i>Jungle Books</i>	20	5	2-7
Stockton	<i>Fanciful Tales</i>	19	5	1-6
Alcott	<i>Little Women</i>	18	5	3-8
Seton	<i>Wild Animals I Have Known</i>	18	5	1-7
Kipling	<i>Just-so Stories</i>	17	5	1-8
Pyle	<i>Merry Adventures of Robin Hood</i>	17	5	4-8
Mabie	<i>Norse Stories Retold from Eddas</i>	16	5	2-8
Andrews	<i>Ten Boys</i>	15	5	3-6
Burnett	<i>Little Lord Fauntleroy</i>	14	5	3-7
Brown	<i>In the Days of Giants</i>	12	5	1-6
Harris	<i>Uncle Remus</i>	12	5	1-7
Long	<i>Wilderness Ways</i>	12	5	3-7
Ewing	<i>Jackanapes</i>	11	5	3-6

SELECTED LIST OF TITLES IN ELEMENTARY SCHOOL
LITERATURE—Continued

	Title	No. Times Recom- mended	Most Frequent Grade	Range of Grades
Kingsley	<i>Greek Heroes</i>	11	5	5-7
Pyle	<i>Story of King Arthur and His Knights</i>	11	5	4-8
Carpenter	<i>North America</i>	9	5	4-6
	<i>Asia</i>	9	5	4-7
Carroll	<i>Through the Looking Glass</i>	9	5	4-7
Clarke	<i>Story of Ulysses</i>	9	5	3-6
Church	<i>Story of the "Odyssey"</i>	9	5	3-8
Page	<i>Two Little Confederates</i>	9	5	3-8
Seton	<i>Lobo, Rag and Vixen</i>	9	5	4-6
	<i>Lives of the Hunted</i>	9	5	4-6
GRADE VI—				
Anonymous	<i>Arabian Nights</i>	22	6	1-8
Dodge	<i>Hans Brinker</i>	19	6	4-8
Alcott	<i>Little Men</i>	17	6	3-8
Irving	<i>Rip Van Winkle</i>	16	6	2-8
Spyri	<i>Heidi</i>	15	6	3-6
Radford	<i>King Arthur and His Knights</i>	14	6	4-8
Swift	<i>Gulliver's Travels</i>	14	6	4-8
Aldrich	<i>Story of a Bad Boy</i>	12	6	4-8
Eggleston	<i>Hoosier School Boy</i>	11	6	3-8
Burroughs	<i>Squirrels and Other Fur Bearers</i>	10	6	5-8
Alcott	<i>Under the Lilacs</i>	9	6	3-6
Carpenter	<i>Europe</i>	9	6	4-7
GRADE VII—				
Lamb	<i>Tales from Shakespeare</i>	28	7	5-8
Dickens	<i>Christmas Carol</i>	25	7	3-8
Whittier	<i>Snow-Bound</i>	24	7	6-8
Longfellow	<i>Miles Standish</i>	23	7	5-8
	<i>Evangeline</i>	23	7	5-8
Irving	<i>Sketch Book</i>	19	7	6-8
Burroughs	<i>Birds and Bees</i>	18	7	6-8
Cooper	<i>Last of the Mohicans</i>	17	7	6-8
Baldwin	<i>Story of Siegfried</i>	13	7	4-7
Cooper	<i>The Spy</i>	13	7	6-8
Franklin	<i>Autobiography</i>	12	7	5-8
Hawthorne	<i>The Great Stone Face</i>	12	7	4-8
Burroughs	<i>Sharp Eyes</i>	11	7	6-8
Dickens	<i>David Copperfield</i>	11	7	5-8
Hawthorne	<i>Grandfather's Chair</i>	11	7	6-8
Irving	<i>The Legend of Sleepy Hollow</i>	11	7	5-8
Kipling	<i>Captains Courageous</i>	11	7	6-8
Macaulay	<i>Horatius at the Bridge</i>	11	7	4-8
Dana	<i>Two Years Before the Mast</i>	11	7	6-8
Clemens	<i>Prince and the Pauper</i>	10	7	5-8
Baldwin	<i>Story of Roland</i>	9	7	5-7
Bunyan	<i>Pilgrim's Progress</i>	9	7	4-8
GRADE VIII—				
Hale	<i>The Man Without a Country</i>	31	8	6-8
Scott	<i>Lady of the Lake</i>	20	8	6-9
Shakespeare	<i>Julius Caesar</i>	18	8	6-9
Stevenson	<i>Treasure Island</i>	17	8	3-8

SELECTED LIST OF TITLES IN ELEMENTARY SCHOOL
LITERATURE—*Concluded*

	Title	No. Times Recom- mended	Most Frequent Grade	Range of Grades
Dickens	<i>Cricket on the Hearth</i>	14	8	6-8
Scott	<i>Ivanhoe</i>	14	8	6-9
Shakespeare	<i>Merchant of Venice</i>	14	8	8-9
Hughes	<i>Tom Brown's School Days</i>	13	8	4-8
Lowell	<i>Vision of Sir Launfal</i>	13	8	7-8
Stowe	<i>Uncle Tom's Cabin</i>	10	8	6-8